Reply to Collignon et al

TO THE EDITOR—We appreciate the correspondence from Collignon et al [1], as it allows us to clarify the findings of our study on trivalent inactivated influenza vaccine (TIV) and the implications for vaccination policy.

We provided complete information on adverse events following vaccination in the primary reports of our trial [2, 3] which are both open access articles and should now be linked on ClinicalTrials.gov. No serious adverse reactions were
observed, while myalgia and local reactions at the injection site were reported more frequently in TIV than placebo recipients. The trial protocol specified a follow-up period of 1 year for the small pilot study [2] and 1 year for the subsequent larger trial in 2009–2010 [3]. Subsequently, we took advantage of the assembled cohort by extending the latter study to a second and third year, thus permitting further observations on annual risks of influenza in children and their household contacts.

Collignon et al claimed that only 4 influenza B infections were prevented by TIV in our trial, but in fact the incidence rate of virologically confirmed influenza B virus infections over the first year of follow-up was 3% in the 479 children randomized to TIV vs 8% in the 317 children randomized to placebo [3], that is, a 5% absolute risk reduction (24 prevented virologically confirmed infections in the 479 TIV recipients). Furthermore, not all influenza infections were virologically confirmed in this study, as in other similar studies, because of asymptomatic infections and underreporting of symptomatic infections.

We agree with Collignon and colleagues that the significant increase in acute respiratory illnesses in year 2 of follow-up in TIV recipients [4] deserves further investigation, but has not been reported in other studies. The 1-year Australian study cited by Collignon et al has now been updated with 5 years of data and no evidence of an increased risk of noninfluenza viruses in vaccinated children [5].

Many randomized controlled trials have demonstrated that vaccination is efficacious in protecting against influenza virus infections [6], yet we also know that immunity following natural infection can be stronger, broader, and can last for longer than vaccine-induced immunity. It is possible to hypothesize that vaccinated persons could face a slightly greater risk of influenza virus infections 2–3 years following vaccination, when vaccine-induced immunity has waned and circulating strains have drifted. For this reason in part, annual vaccination is recommended.

We agree with Collignon et al that more prospective studies of TIV in school-aged children would be welcome. This would, however, require substantial, sustained investment of human and financial resources that have time and again proved a step too far for overstretched funding bodies.

Notes

Financial support. Authors received support from the Research Fund for the Control of Infectious Diseases of the Health, Welfare and Food Bureau of the Hong Kong SAR Government (grant numbers CHP-CE-03 and 11100882), and the Area of Excellence Scheme of the Hong Kong University Grants Committee (grant number AoE/M-12/06).

Potential conflicts of interest. B. J. C. has received research funding from MedImmune Inc and Sanofi Pasteur and consults for Crucell NV. J. S. M. P. receives research funding from Crucell NV. G. M. L. has received consulting honoraria from Janssen Pharmaceuticals. All other authors report no potential conflicts.

All authors have submitted the ICMJE Form for Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest. Conflicts that the editors consider relevant to the content of the manuscript have been disclosed.

Benjamin J. Cowling,1 J. S. Malik Peiris,1,2 and Gabriel M. Leung1

1School of Public Health, and 2Centre of Influenza Research, Li Ka Shing Faculty of Medicine, The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, China

References


Correspondence: Benjamin J. Cowling, PhD, School of Public Health, Li Ka Shing Faculty of Medicine, The University of Hong Kong, 21 Sassoon Road, Pokfulam, Hong Kong (bcowling@hku.hk).